Which Way Forward?

People, Forests, and Policymaking in Indonesia

EDITED BY

Carol J. Pierce Colfer and
Ida Aju Pradnja Resosudarmo

RESOURCES FOR THE FUTURE
WASHINGTON, DC, USA

CENTER FOR INTERNATIONAL
FORESTRY RESEARCH
BOGOR, INDONESIA

INSTITUTE OF SOUTHEAST
ASIAN STUDIES
SINGAPORE

©2002 Resources for the Future

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced by any means, either electronic or mechanical, without permission in writing from the publisher, except under the conditions given in the following paragraph.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, the internal or personal use of specific clients, and for educational classroom use is granted by Resources for the Future, provided that the appropriate fee is paid directly to Copyright Clearance Center. Telephone +1 (978) 750–8400; fax +1 (978) 750–4470.

Printed in the United States of America

An RFF Press book
Published by Resources for the Future
1616 P Street, NW, Washington, DC 20036–1400

A copublication of Resources for the Future (www.rff.org), the Center for International Forestry Research (www.cifor.org), and the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (www.iseas.edu.sg).

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Which way forward?: people, forests, and policymaking in Indonesia / Carol J. Pierce Colfer and Ida Aju Pradnja Resosudarmo, editors.

p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 1–891853–44–9 (lib. bdg.) — ISBN 1–891853–45–7 (pbk.)
1. Forest policy—Indonesia. 2. Forest management—Indonesia. I. Colfer, Carol J. Pierce. II. Resosudarmo, Ida Aju Pradnja.

SD657.I5 W55 2001
333.75'09598—dc21 2001047675

f e d c b a

The paper in this book meets the guidelines for permanence and durability of the Committee on Production Guidelines for Book Longevity of the Council on Library Resources.

The geographical boundaries and titles depicted in this publication, whether in maps, other illustrations, or text, do not imply any judgement or opinion about the legal status of a territory on the part of Resources for the Future, the Center for International Forestry Research, the Institute for Southeast Asian Studies, or any other organization that has participated in the preparation of this publication.

The findings, interpretations, and conclusions offered herein are those of the contributing authors. They do not necessarily represent the views of Resources for the Future, its directors, or officers, and they do not represent the views of any other institution that has participated in the development of this publication.

ISBN 1–891853–44–9 (cloth) ISBN 1–891853–45–7 (paper)









About Resources for the Future and RFF Press

Resources for the Future (RFF) improves environmental and natural resources policymaking worldwide through independent social science research of the highest caliber. Founded in 1952, RFF pioneered the application of economics as a tool to develop more effective policy about the use and conservation of natural resources. Its scholars continue to employ social science methods to analyze critical issues concerning pollution control, energy policy, land and water use, hazardous waste, climate change, biodiversity, and the environmental challenges of developing countries.

RFF Press supports the mission of RFF by publishing book-length works that present a broad range of approaches to the study of natural resources and the environment. Its authors and editors include RFF staff, researchers from the larger academic and policy communities, and journalists.

About the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies

The Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) was established in Singapore as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional center for scholars and other specialists concerned with modern Southeast Asia, particularly the multifaceted problems of stability and security, economic development, and political and social change.

About the Center for International Forestry Research

The Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR) was established in 1993 as part of the Consultative Group on International Agricultural Research (CGIAR) in response to global concerns about the social, environmental, and economic consequences of forest loss and degradation. CIFOR research produces knowledge and methods needed to improve the well-being of forest-dependent people and to help tropical countries manage their forests wisely for sustained benefits. This research is done in more than two dozen countries, in cooperation with numerous partners. Since it was founded, CIFOR has also played a central role in influencing global and national forestry policies.

Resources for the Future

Directors

Catherine G. Abbott
Julia Carabias
Norman L. Christensen Jr.
James H. S. Cooper
John M. Deutch
Anthony S. Earl
Dod A. Fraser
Mary A. Gade
F. Henry Habicht II
Kenneth L. Lay
Lawrence H. Linden
Frank E. Loy
Lawrence U. Luchini
Jim Maddy
Karl-Göran Mäler
Frank L. Matthews
William D. Nordhaus
James F. O'Grady Jr.
Steven W. Percy
Mark A. Pisano
Roger W. Sant
Robert M. Solow
Joseph E. Stiglitz
Edward L. Strohbehn Jr.
Linda C. Taliaferro
Victoria J. Tschinkel

Officers

Darius W. Gaskins Jr., *Chairman*
Robert E. Grady, *Vice Chairman*
Paul R. Portney, *President*
Edward F. Hand, *Vice President–Finance and Administration*
Raymond J. Kopp, *Vice President–Programs*
Lesli A. Creedon, *Secretary and Director of Development*

Contents

Contributors viii

Acknowledgments xiii

FOREWORD xvii
Jeffrey A. Sayer

INTRODUCTION 1

CHAPTER ONE
Changing Policy Discourses and Traditional Communities, 1960–1999 20
Rachel Wrangham

CHAPTER TWO
Ideas and Institutions in Social Forestry Policy 36
Rita Lindayati

CHAPTER THREE
Responsibility, Accountability, and National Unity in Village Governance 60
Chris P. A. Bennett

CHAPTER FOUR
Devolution and Indonesia's New Forestry Law **81**
Eva Wollenberg and Hariadi Kartodihardjo

CHAPTER FIVE
Differing Perspectives on Community Forestry in Indonesia **110**
Jeffrey Y. Campbell

CHAPTER SIX
Reforming the Reformists in Post-Soeharto Indonesia **126**
Chip Fay and Martua Sirait

CHAPTER SEVEN
Structural Problems in Implementing New Forestry Policies **144**
Hariadi Kartodihardjo

CHAPTER EIGHT
Timber Management and Related Policies **161**
A Review
Ida Aju Pradnja Resosudarmo

CHAPTER NINE
Timber Concession Reform **191**
Questioning the "Sustainable Logging" Paradigm
Christopher Barr

CHAPTER TEN
The Political Economy of Indonesia's Oil Palm Subsector **221**
Anne Casson

CHAPTER ELEVEN
Effects of Crisis and Political Change, 1997–1999 **246**
William D. Sunderlin

CHAPTER TWELVE
Corporate Debt and the Indonesian Forestry Sector **277**
Christopher Barr, David Brown, Anne Casson, and David Kaimowitz

CHAPTER THIRTEEN
Forest Fires in Indonesia **293**
Impacts and Solutions
Grahame Applegate, Ross Smith, James J. Fox, Andrew Mitchell, David Packham, Nigel Tapper, and Graham Baines

CHAPTER FOURTEEN
Ten Propositions to Explain Kalimantan's Fires 309
Carol J. Pierce Colfer

CHAPTER FIFTEEN
Forests and Regional Autonomy 325
The Challenge of Sharing the Profits and Pains
Ida Aju Pradnja Resosudarmo and Ahmad Dermawan

CHAPTER SIXTEEN
Dynamics of Illegal Logging in Indonesia 358
Richard G. Dudley

CONCLUSION 383

AFTERWORD
Indonesian Forests and People in Change 394
Emil Salim

APPENDIX
Timeline of Significant Indonesian Legislation 404

Abbreviations and Acronyms 410

Glossary 418

Index 422

Contributors

Grahame Applegate is a forest scientist with the Sustainable Forest Management program at the Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR). His research focuses on forest management as it relates to underlying causes of fire in Indonesia and improved practices in natural forests as part of sustainable forest management.

Graham Baines is a freelance consultant in tropical natural resources and environmental management. His academic training is in agricultural science, plant ecology, and environmental physics. He has participated in a number of short-term missions addressing biodiversity issues in Indonesia.

Christopher Barr is a policy scientist with CIFOR's Underlying Causes of Deforestation, Forest Degradation, and Changes in Human Welfare program. His current research focuses on the effect of the International Monetary Fund and World Bank structural adjustment policies on Indonesia's forest-based industries, corporate debt, and forest-sector finance. He also studys the likely effects of decentralization on forest administration in East Kalimantan and Riau.

Chris P. A. Bennett is an associate with the Food and Resource Economics Group, Faculty of Agricultural Sciences, University of British Columbia. He also teaches courses at the University of British Columbia. A plant pathologist

who has moved into agroforestry and forest policy analysis, he has served as a consultant for the Harvard Institute for International Development, World Bank, United States Agency for International Development, U.K. Department for International Development (DFID), the Ford Foundation, and CIFOR.

David Brown was recently awarded a Ph.D. from the Department of Political Science of the University of Washington. His research examines the appropriation of timber rent by political elites in insular Southeast Asia. He has served as a consultant to DFID, studying the political-economic and supply-and-demand profiles of Indonesia's timber industry. He has worked as an equities analyst with the global investment bank Dresdner Kleinwort Benson.

Jeffrey Y. Campbell is a program officer in environment and development with the Ford Foundation. Currently posted in the foundation's New York Office, he spent six and one-half years with the foundation in India and three and one-half years in the Jakarta office. The primary focus of his work is facilitating the development of community-based natural resource management from the grass roots to the policy level.

Anne Casson is a research fellow in the Resource Management in Asia–Pacific Project, Australian National University. She has conducted research in Indonesia since 1991 and has recently completed her doctoral thesis on the political economy of the Indonesian oil palm subsector through the School of Resources, Environment, and Society of Australian National University. While performing research for her Ph.D., she was a consultant for CIFOR's Underlying Causes of Deforestation, Forest Degradation, and Changes in Human Welfare program. She continues to work on the oil palm subsector and the current process of decentralization in Indonesia's forest sector.

Carol J. Pierce Colfer is leader of the CIFOR program on Local People, Devolution, and Adaptive Collaborative Management. An anthropologist, she has conducted research in Indonesia since 1979, primarily in Kalimantan and Sumatra, where she has focused on rural people's interactions with forests. She has also conducted long-term fieldwork in Iran, Oman, and the United States, with shorter-term work on projects involving criteria and indicators for assessing human well-being in Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Brazil, and Gabon. She is coeditor of *People Managing Forests: The Links between Human Well-Being and Sustainability*.

Ahmad Dermawan is research program assistant in the Underlying Causes of Deforestation, Forest Degradation, and Changes in Human Welfare program and the Sustainable Forest Management program at CIFOR. His work has focused on the effects of the economic crisis on forest cover, and the decentralization of policymaking and administration of policies affecting forests in Indonesia. He has researched the effects of the economic crisis on

the foodcrop sector and has studied agroforestry and the role of extension to farmers in West Java.

Richard G. Dudley has more than 20 years experience working with developing-country scientists and administrators in the management of natural fish populations, conservation of aquatic and marine resources, and the assessment of environmental impacts on fisheries and other resources. He has a special interest in helping countries improve their own natural resource management capabilities. He has served as team leader on Asian Development Bank and U.S. Agency for International Development funded projects in Oman and Indonesia to develop new research programs in the management of fisheries and related resources. In Indonesia, he has worked both with local universities and the central government to review the qualifications of consultants and strengthen university teaching and research in marine science.

Chip Fay is a leading member of the research team at the International Centre for Research in Agroforestry (ICRAF) that works on land and tree tenure, assisting the governments in Indonesia and the Philippines in their efforts to develop and strengthen regulatory decrees and legislation, to implement programs that enable forest-dependent communities to maintain their livelihood, and to sustainably manage areas of state-defined forest zones. He has served as a project officer for Southeast Asia at Survival International, program officer for the Ford Foundation in Indonesia, and as director of the Southeast Asia Office of the Environmental Policy Institute.

James J. Fox is professor and director at the Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies. A social anthropologist, he has done research on a wide range of social, ecological, and resource policy issues in Indonesia, including rice intensification, integrated pest management, and marine and forest management and development. He is author of *Harvest of the Palm: Ecological Change in Eastern Indonesia*.

David Kaimowitz, an economist, is director general of CIFOR. He previously worked for the Inter-American Institute for Cooperation in Agriculture, the International Service for National Agricultural Research, and the Ministry of Agriculture of Nicaragua. He has published widely on issues in forest and agricultural policy.

Hariadi Kartodihardjo is a lecturer at the Faculty of Forestry, Bogor Agriculture Institute. He is in active collaboration with several local nongovernmental organizations and is one of the founders of the Indonesian Ecolabelling Institute. He also currently serves as an adviser to the Ministry of Forestry and Estate Crops as a member of the Forestry and Estate Crops Development Reform Committee.

Rita Lindayati is completing her Ph.D. in environmental studies at York University in Canada. Her research interests include community forestry,

local-based resource management, policy studies, and political ecology in Southeast Asia. Her fieldwork has focused on Bali, Kalimantan, Sumatra, and Jakarta.

Andrew Mitchell is a graduate forester with more than 20 years of experience in both temperate and tropical forestry. He has consulted and worked on numerous projects and review missions throughout the world. He has undertaken work on the total economic valuation of ecosystems in Bangladesh and Belize and has worked on forest revenue systems in Suriname, Belize, and Bangladesh.

David Packham is a rural fire consultant based in Melbourne. A chemist by training, his major work has been in fire retardants, heat and mass transfer in wildfires, and fire detection systems for buildings. He has served as deputy director of the Australian Disaster College and as supervising meteorologist for rural fire warning services at the Australian Bureau of Meteorology.

Ida Aju Pradnja Resosudarmo is leader of the CIFOR Underlying Causes of Deforestation, Forest Degradation, and Changes in Human Welfare program. Her major areas of research are population and migration trends, forest and forestry-related policies, the decentralization process, and the effects of the economic crisis on forest cover and the well-being of forest villagers in Indonesia.

Emil Salim is professor of economics at the University of Indonesia. His positions in the Indonesian government include Minister for Population and the Environment. Internationally, he has served on advisory boards and committees at the United Nations and World Health Organization; he was president of the U.N. Environment Program Governing Council from 1985–1987. Currently, he is leading a review about the future role of the World Bank Group in the extractive industries to promote poverty reduction and sustainable development. He is co-chair of the World Commission on Forest and Sustainable Development and chair of the Board of Trustees of the Foundation for Sustainable Development (Jakarta). Pak Salim holds doctorates in economics from the University of Indonesia and the University of California at Berkeley. His books include *Masalah Pembangunan Indonesia* (*Development Problems in Indonesia*) and *Lingkungan Hidup dan Pembangunan* (*Environment and Development*).

Jeffrey A. Sayer was director general of CIFOR from its inception in 1992 until July 2001. An ecologist by training, he has long been involved in the field of conservation. He has worked with the Food and Agriculture Organization, the International Union for the Conservation of Nature/World Conservation Union, the World Bank, and now the World Wide Fund for Nature. He has conducted research in Africa, South America, and Asia.

Martua Sirait is a scientist at ICRAF. He is also working on community forestry policy in the Outer Islands of Indonesia to assist the Indonesian Forestry Department. His activities are part of the regional policy research project funded by the Asian Development Bank and the Ford Foundation. Previously he worked with the World Wide Fund for Nature's Indonesia Program on community mapping at Kayan Mentarang Nature Reserve, East Kalimantan.

Ross Smith is the assistant commissioner for the New South Wales Rural Fire Service. He worked with the New South Wales Forestry Commission from 1963 to 1994, specializing in forest fire management and environmental audit and compliance. Since joining the Rural Fire Service, he has provided forest fire and emergency management consultant services to agencies in Spain, Indonesia, Croatia, and China.

William D. Sunderlin is a sociologist working in CIFOR's Underlying Causes of Deforestation, Forest Degradation, and Changes in Human Welfare program. His main area of research has been the effect of economic crisis and structural adjustment policies on the well-being of forest villagers and on forest cover change in Cameroon and Indonesia. He has also conducted research on the relationship of livestock sector expansion and forest cover loss in Honduras and the relationship of mineral exports to tropical deforestation.

Nigel Tapper is head of the School of Geography and Environmental Science at Monash University, Melbourne, Australia. He is also joint coordinator of the Monash Atmospheric Science Program and deputy director of the Monash Environment Institute. His research interests include indigenous forecasting systems (i.e., local weather knowledge and its application) and environmental change and variability in Southeast Asia, with a focus on rainfall variability in the area of the El Niño–Southern Oscillation and the impact of the variability of crop production and fire in Indonesia.

Eva (Lini) Wollenberg is a researcher at CIFOR where she focuses on social learning among forest stakeholders and the means for empowering local communities, especially in the tropical regions of Asia. Before joining CIFOR in 1994, she worked for the Ford Foundation's Asia Rural Poverty and Resources Program. She has had extensive experience working in the Philippines and Borneo.

Rachel Wrangham is an associate professional officer with DFID and a Ph.D. candidate at the London School of Economics. Her social anthropology research in Indonesia has covered a wide range of issues, including local perceptions of development, changing resource management strategies, and poverty. Currently focusing on rural development in Mozambique, she has also worked in India and Thailand.

Acknowledgments

This book evolved in response to the availability of a number of relatively independent analyses of Indonesia's rapidly changing conditions in 1999. A diverse set of authors, writing from very different perspectives, were producing analyses that we felt shed significant light on the rapid evolution of Indonesian policy. This compilation includes contributions supported by a wide range of institutions, which we would like to highlight here.

Although some chapters include acknowledgments, we felt it important to recognize those who contributed in a more global way. The Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR) demonstrated its institutional flexibility by allowing the editors the freedom to pursue this serendipitous opportunity under their auspices, with additional financial contributions as needed. Similarly, the closely affiliated International Centre for Agroforestry Research (ICRAF) responded flexibly by supporting some of their staff members to participate in this endeavor. We thank the many CIFOR and ICRAF colleagues who read and critiqued various drafts and served as sounding boards for our ideas. We also want to thank Rahayu Koesnadi, Linda Yuliani, and Atie Puntodewo at CIFOR, Rebecca Henderson and Don Reisman at Resources for the Future (RFF), and Chrysa Cullather for their assistance throughout the production process. We are grateful to Mark Poffenberger and David Kaimowitz who reviewed an early version of the entire book, as well as to the anonymous reviewers selected by RFF. The input of these

reviewers improved the quality of our analyses and writing, and we very much appreciate their work.

Parts of this book have also been supported by the Asian Development Bank and the U.K. Department for International Development. We thank them most sincerely for their vital contributions. We also thank Institut Pertanian Bogor (Bogor Agricultural Institute) in Bogor, the Ford Foundation, Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia (Indonesian National Science Foundation), the Australian National University and York University, with whom various of our authors are affiliated.

As book editors, we are particularly grateful to the authors who first wrote their chapters and then responded graciously without exception, to our repeated requests for revisions and additional information throughout this long process. The authors were also industrious in providing each other with constructive critiques, which also enriched the final product.

We are all particularly indebted to the many Indonesian government and industry personnel, researchers, and other Indonesia specialists who have contributed to our thinking and provided critical information. We are grateful to the Indonesian government, which has overseen a sea change in terms of Indonesia's acceptance of critical analysis since the Soeharto era. Had we written this book under Soeharto, it would have been a more perilous undertaking. Finally, we thank the rural people of Indonesia who have patiently survived our questions and curiosity with unfailing good humor. We hope that their help and cooperation is justified by the utility of this book, in the process of answering the question that the book's title poses: Which way forward?

Dedication

Carol dedicates this book to her husband, Richard G. Dudley. His deep concerns about the environment and Indonesian policies, combined with his continual, faithful, and strong support, have been important forces leading to this work. She also dedicates this book to her son, Andrew Balan Pierce (also known as "Alan"). Straddling the cultures of Indonesia and the United States even more than his mother, he cares about Indonesia, its people, and its future as much as she does. He is an eternal source of delight and pride.

Ida Aju Pradnja dedicates this book to her parents, Ida Pedanda Gede Nyoman Jelantik Oka and Jero Istri Nengah; to her husband, Budy; and to her children, Adhikara, Kalyana, and Wisesa.

Which Way Forward?