Appendix 9

Levelling the Playing Field:
Fair Partnership for Local Development to Improve the Forest Sustainability in Southeast Asia

Minutes of Meeting of Provincial Steering Committee (PrSC) and Progress of TWG

University of the Philippines Los Banos (UPLB)

Centre de Cooperation Internationale en Recherche Agronomique pour le Developpment (CIRAD)
Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR)

Minutes of Meeting of Provincial Steering Committee

1ST Provincial Steering Committee (PrSC) Meeting
Café Tribu, Rizal Avenue, Puerto Princesa City
March 29, 2005

Time Duration: 10:00 AM– 12:03 PM

Present:

	Name	Position/Designation	Office
1	Jovenee Cawiling	Officer In-Charge	City Planning and Development Office,
2	Emelina Cojamco	Chief Forest Mgt. Sector	DENR-PENRO
3	Nelson Devanadera	Executive Director	PCSD
4	Maribeth Caymo	Area Manager- ARMO South	PCSD
5	Reuben Jardin	Provincial Officer	Dept. of Agri. – Bureau of fisheries and Aquatic Resources (DA-BFAR)
6	Teodoro Villanueva	National Coordinator	Levelling the Playing Field (LPF) Project
7	Ma. Eduarda Devanadera	Consultant	Levelling the Playing Field (LPF) Project
8	Teodoro Zernan	Technical Working Group (TWG)	TWG, San Rafael, Puerto Princesa City
9	Beatriz Dacles	Technical Working Group (TWG)	TWG, Concepcion, Puerto Princesa City
10	Gaudencio Osano	Technical Working Group (TWG)	TWG, Tanabag, Puerto Princesa City
11	Melquiades Rodriguez	Brgy. Captain	San Rafael, Puerto Princesa City
12	Epitacio Abrea	Brgy. Captain	Tanabag, Puerto Princesa City
13	Rossana Rodriguez	Brgy. Councillor	Concepcion, Puerto Princesa City

I. Prayer

The meeting started at 10:00AM by a prayer led by Ms. Beatriz P. Dacles, TWG facilitator.

II. Call to order

Dr. Teodoro Villanueva welcomed the participants represented by different agencies, and the three Barangays. He called the meeting to order.

III. Welcome Remarks – Dr. Teodoro Villanueva

In behalf of the LPF project partners in based in Indonesia, LPF staff in the Philippines, different partners agencies in Palawan, Brgy. Captains and councils and TWG from Three Barangays (San Rafael, Tanabag, Concepcion), Ted Villanueva expressed his gratitude for the continued support of the participants. He also expressed his wish that the participants will participate throughout the whole day.

IV. Attendance and Apologies

Ted Villanueva requested Suzy to read the attendance sheet.

V. Briefing about the LPF and its progress

Ted Villanueva provided a background of LPF project.

VI. Sharing of Barangay captains about LPF

Barangay Captain Epitacio Abrea of Tanabag and Barangay Captain Melquides of San Rafael Rodriguez both expressed appreciation of the activities and project that LPF have brought to the communities. They look forward to useful lessons that they will get for today's meeting and workshop. There was no problem in adopting the project in their barangays.

VII. Highlights of the Discussion

A. Roles and responsibilities of PrSC

PCSD Executive Director Nelson Devanadera proposed the following roles of PrSC:

1. Direction Setting – According to him the PrSC can help the LPF in identifying priority activities consistent with the provincial priorities.

2. Policy formulation to enhance the attainment of objectives – Because most members can influence policy formulation, PrSC can serve as a venue to identify and discuss policies that can at the same help achieve the objectives of the project.

3. Oversight function: PrSC can also serve as venue to resolves conflicts among agencies and organizations in the province.

4. Resource generation – The PrSC can also assist in generating funds for projects of the communities.

5. PrSc can assist in forming the Provincial Resource Learning Center by using the LPF project as model in natural resources management.

Dr. Villanueva explained that during PrSC meetings LPF project will present its accomplishments and activities. Feedbacks will be provided by the committee.

According to Dir. Devanadera, since the PrSC concern is province wide, the three sites can be a model and it can be replicated to other sites, either in municipality or barangay levels.

Mr. Zernan Teodoro expressed the advantages of having the PrSC. He stated that here in PrSC, several government agencies are represented and they can be tapped to solve problems that transcend provincial, city, and barangay levels.

Dir. Devanadera replied that TWGs in the project site are action groups while the PrSC can be the support group.

For. Emy Cojamco gave an example of how the PrSC can help. This is the case of Brgy. Concepcion, the barangay where LPF was not adopted by the Barangay Council and was only adopted through a public hearing. For. Cojamco said that in case like this, the PrSC can back-up the TWG. She also suggested that different agencies must have a permanent representative to attend the PrSC meeting.

Dir. Devanadera suggested that there must be a resolution coming from barangay councils to legally endorse or recognize the Provincial Steering Committee.

Dr. Villanueva suggested that administrative matters pertaining PrSC activities be clarified, like per diem, transportation expenses, venue, food, etc. He also suggested that PrSC adopt a set of house rules or operating procedures to guide its members

Ms. Devanadera suggested that the above matter be prepared by the LPF project staff and discussed in the next meeting.

Dr. Villanueva said that the LPF project staff has volunteered to formulate the Standard Operating Procedures of PrSC. The PrSC existence will also be communicated to the head of offices or to different agencies so they will learn that there is an existing PrSC for “Leveling the Playing Field” project.

The group agreed to meet quarterly.

Dir. Devandera suggested that the meeting place to alternate between Puerto Princesa City and the three barangays.

Mr. Jardin moved to adopt the PrSC roles suggested by Dir. Devanadera. It was adopted by the PrSC members at exactly 11:25AM on March 29, 2005.

Mr. Jardin proposed that other agencies should be added as members of PrSC, such as city agriculture or provincial agriculture to address the problem in agricultural aspect.

For. Emy Cojamco, suggested that the positions in the PrSC be agreed upon first and then elect the people to said positions. The committee agreed on the suggestion.

Mr. Zaldy Cayatoc that there should be a chairman, vice chairman, and sub-committees. The committee agreed to the suggestion.

Mr. Jardin suggested that the chairman is PCSD and vice-chairman is city planning and others could be members. Everybody agreed to this suggestion.

Below are the elected officers of PrSC:

Position	Name of Person Elected	Office	Remarks
Chairman	Nelson P. Devanadera	PCSD	
Vice-Chairman	Jovenee Cawiling	City Planning	
Sub-Committees:			
1) Upland	Rey Crisostomo	DENR-PENRO	
2) Lowland	Nelson S. Salvador	Provincial Agriculture	Suggested as additional member of PrSC
3) Coastal	Reuben Jardin	DA-BFAR - Province	
4) Livelihood and Marketing		DA-PAES	Suggested as additional member of PrSC
5) Local Governance	Recardo Z. Austria	DILG – Province	Suggested as additional member of PrSC
Members:			
	Teodoro Villanueva	LPF National Coordinator	
	Doodee Devanadera	LPF Consultant	
	Halid K. Dawili	DILG – City	Suggested as additional member of PrSC
	Melquiades Rodriguez	Brgy. Captain, San Rafael	
	Epitacio Abrea	Brgy. Captain, Tanabag	
	Candido Canete	Brgy. Captain, Concepcion	

Follow-up Actions

The following tasks and activities were identified:
- LPF Staff to complete the directory of the PrSC Members.

- PCSD to give priority to the three barangays (San Rafael, Tanabag and Concepcion) for ECAN delineation of three landscape. PCSD is just waiting for the go signal from the City Mayor.
- LPF staff to set the date of next meeting and induction of officers and members of PrSC. The proposed venue is Brgy. Tanabag. It's suggested by PrSC members to invite Mayor Hagedorn.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:03 PM.

Roles and Responsibilities of Provincial Steering Committee Members

I. Background

In Southeast Asia, including Philippines, new policies that provide the rights to local stakeholders to manage parts of forests and natural resources are emerging. As a result, different stakeholders have different roles to play. Their different kind and levels of skills, knowledge, and authorities make management of natural resources complex. Within these contexts, "Levelling the Playing Field" project was planned and developed to respond to this issue. This project is an international research project managed by Centre De Cooperation Internationale on Recherche Agronomique Pour Le Developpment (CIRAD) and Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR). It is implemented by University Philippines Los Banos, College, Laguna in the three Barangay's of San Rafael, Tanabag, and Concepcion, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan. The project aims to improve natural resources management by facilitating, coordination, communication, negotiation, and collective action among relevant stakeholders at different levels, from community to city and provincial level.

One of the effective tools to carry-out the project strategies is the strong linkages among the various agencies involved natural resources management. The different agencies can be brought together in one forum and they can be done through the LPF Project steering committee (PrSC). The PrSC shall provide direction and guidance in implementing Levelling the Playing Field project and its activities. Furthermore, PrSC will ensure the sustainability of Levelling the Playing Field activities in the three barangays even after the end of the project.

II. Roles and responsibilities of PrSC

1. Direction Setting – The PrSC can help the LPF in identifying priority activities consistent with the provincial priorities.
2. Policy formulation to enhance the attainment of objectives – Because most members can influence policy formulation, PrSC can serve as a venue to identify and discuss policies that can at the same help achieve the objectives of the project.
3. Oversight function - PrSC can also serve as venue to resolves conflicts among agencies and organizations in the province.
4. Resource generation – The PrSC can also assist in generating funds for the projects of the communities.
5. PrSc can assist in forming the Provincial Resource Learning Center by using the LPF project as model in natural resources management.

III. Composition of Provincial Steering Committee (PrSC) Members

Chairman:	**Dir. Nelson P. Devanadera** PCSDS, Executive Director

Vice-Chairman:	**Engr. Jovenee Cawiling** City Planning, OIC
Sub-Committees:	
1. Upland:	**Mr. Rey Crisostomo** PENRO Officer, DENR
2. Lowland:	**Mr. Nelson Salvador** Provincial Agriculture Officer
3. Coastal:	**Mr. Rueben Jardin** Provincial Officer – DA-BFAR
4. Livelihood& Marketing	**Engr. Elmer T. Ferry** SuperIntendent Agricultural Center Chief III, DA- PAES
5. Local Governance	**Ricardo Z. Austria** Provincial DILG Officer

Members:

1. Department of Interior and Local Government – City level
2. Dr. Teodoro R. Villanueva – LPF Representative
3. Ms. Doodee Devanadera – LPF Representative
4. Hon. Melquiades Rodriguez – Brgy. Captain of San Rafael
5. Hon. Epitacio Abrea – Brgy. Captain of Tanabag
6. Hon. Candido Canete – Brgy. Captain of Concepcion
7. Mr. Zernan Teodoro – Technical Working Group, San Rafael
8. Mr. Gaudencio Osano – Technical Working Group, Tanabag
9. Ms. Beatriz P. Dacles – Technical working Group, Concepcion

IV. Administrative Matters

- The meals and transportation expenses of the meeting will be shouldered by LPF project.
- The agenda will be based on the activities in the field and it will be provided to the Provincial Steering Committee members before the meeting.
- The PrSC members shall meet every quarter of the year or as needed.
- The venue of the PrSC meeting will depend upon the agreement of the members.
- The transportation expenses of the PrSC members should be liquidated after the meeting is completed.

Prepared by:
Azucena E. Gamutia
Field Assistant - LPF Project

Attested by:
Teodoro R. Villanueva
National Coordinator - LPF Project

TWG Activities, 2nd year of implementation

November 24-29, 2004

Around 20 members of TWG joined the Facilitation Training conducted at Duchess Beach Resort, San Rafael, Puerto Princesa City. The aim of the training is to enhance TWG's facilitation skills in facilitation so that they can effectively address their own problems in the three barangays. The main facilitator is a Los Banos-based international consultant. Besides TWG members, 5 participants were staff of government agencies in Puerto Princesa City. The government agencies are partners of the LPF project.

January 21-22, 2005

Paolo Campo visited the three barangays as preparation for the upcoming CORMAS modelling activities. The aim is to orient and familiarize the three sites for the coming activities. He also met some TWG members.

January 26, 2005

LPF team fedback the results of market study, socio-economic survey to TWG members. This session provided opportunity for the team to validate the results and provide inputs to TWG to their list of identified problems. Brgy. Official. Councilor Antulo of Concepcion reacted on the issue presented about Bataks on their needs for a teacher and school, and the issue that some Brgy. Officials were involved in illegal activities.

February 4, 2005

Special presentation of LPF Project to barangay council of Concepcion. It was facilitated by Ms. Eduarda D. Devanadera and Emmy Cojamco from DENR-PENRO. It was frustrating to the TWG members since they felt that the councilors, from the barangay themselves, did not accept the project. Please see minutes of meeting for details.

February 12, 2005

A meeting was held for the 2nd round of prioritization of problems in Barangay San Rafael, Tanabag and Concepcion. Results and inputs of market study, socio-economic survey were used. The issues and problems were validated and prioritized. Please see minutes of meeting for details.

February 19, 2005

Public hearing for adoption of LPF project in Barangay Concepcion. Almost one hundred persons gathered in the barangay hall. Ted Villanueva explained the project to the participants. Brgy. Captain Epitacio Abrea of Tanabag was there to express his support for the project. When Captain Canete of Concepcion asked the community

members if they were willing to accept the Project in their barangay, everybody replied yes! According to some members of the TWG, while the meeting was conducted inside the Brgy. Hall, two barangay kagawads were campaigning outside for the community members not to accept the LPF project. This did not work. The participants inside the Brgy. Hall approved the LPF project. TWG did the ground work so that the community provide their support.

Since the community directly accepted the project, the TWG members asked Ted if it is necessary to make a barangay resolution adopting LPF project. He replied that it is not necessary since the community itself have adopted the project.

Feb. 18-March 6, 2005

Multi-stakeholders Landscape assessment was conducted in Batak village Sitio Kalakuasan, Brgy. Tanabag, Puerto Princesa City. The team consisted of ten members led by Manuel Boissiere. It was composed of 7 technical staff and 3 supporting guides from the community. The participants were divided into two groups: the village team and the field team. On the first day the whole team members did a courtesy call to the villagers and conducted community mapping. On the next day and onwards, the village team conducted Pebble Distribution Method (PDM) exercise to determine the importance of the natural resources (plants, animals) to Bataks and how they often use it. For the field team, they established plots on different landscapes (one plot was established on each landscape). All plants in the plots were collected and their uses were identified. The specimen were preserved and brought to Palawan State University, Puerto Princesa City, under the coordination of Mrs. Beth Jeronilla the taxonomist of MLA Team.

March 17, 2005

It was the 1st meeting of TWG in the second year of LPF project, in which facilitators and assistant facilitators was identified, roles, responsibilities and benefits of TWG were reviewed, PAR loops were presented by LPF team. TWG then tried to develop loops for each identified priority problems. Please see minutes of meetings.

March 29, 2005

This was the first meeting and Organization of Provincial Steering Committee. Thirteen persons came: 3 TWG representative, one per barangay, 3 Barangay captains, and the rest were from different government agencies. Director Devanadera informed the participants that PCSD has a project on ECAN delineation. Their priority areas are at west coast part of Palawan but they will give priority to the three barangays (San Rafael, Tanabag, Concepcion). This concerns both forest and coastal area. Please see minutes of meeting.

April 6, 2005

Councilor Corazon Dalabajan organized training for ornamentals and cut flowers in San Rafael for Rural Improvement Club (RIC) group. According to her, the two

barangays can join in. She invited persons from the two barangays who want to participate in the said training. The attendees can avail fifty (50) pieces of orchids from city agriculture and the beneficiaries will return the same amount of orchids after 3 years.

April 28, 2005

This was the meeting of TWG with market study team (consisting of Marina Goloubinoff and Doodee Devanadera). TWG presented their focused priority problems based on the result of 2nd prioritization last February 12, 2005. Please see minutes of meeting.

May 4, 2005

Meeting of TWG with Herlina and Ted. The team informed TWG on the upcoming visit of Steering Committee and LPF team members from Indonesia and Malaysia. The visit will take place on May 11-12. During the discussion, TWG asked if the trainings on nito can be pursued. The issue of compensation provided to individual TWG members to cover their meal expenses (PhP 130) was also discussed. After long discussion, the group decided to continue the nito training and the current compensation practice of the group. Please see minutes of meeting.

May 11-12, 2005

Visit of LPF Steering Committee members. On May 11, there was a presentation from different Government agencies, i.e. DENR-PENRO and PCSDS in Puerto Princesa City. On May 12, 2005, a field visit to several places in three barangays took place. Please see the minutes of meeting.

May 19, 2005

Training in Brgy. Concepcion on ornamentals, cut flowers and food processing in collaboration with City Agriculture. TWG members, specifically the lowland group, helped in organizing the training on flowers and food processing by inviting people and providing their assistance during training. As counterpart budget, the LPF project provided snacks and provided plastic bags (for planting) to participants. Almost 57 persons were attended.

May 20, 2005

Training on para rubber Plantation at Brgy. San Rafael, Puerto Princesa City. The trainors came from Palawan State University. This training conducted through the coordination of Brgy. Councilor Corazon Dalabajan with the Provincial Agriculture's Office.

May 23-June, 23, 2005

TWG (the livelihood and marketing group) participated in the provincial Baragatan Festival 2005. This is a yearly activity of the Provincial government where all municipalities and other private sectors, NGO's and individuals display and sell their different products at the Provincial Capitol Square Park. The festival takes place for a month, usually in the month of May and June. Eight TWG members participated in the said activity where they displayed and sold products from three barangays such as: fruits (banana, mango), processed foods (spicy dilis, fried cashew, sampalok candy, honey), and flowers. TWG also tried to find local markets for their nito handicraft and flowering plants. These two livelihood options are being explored and developed under LPF project.

May 25, 2005

Training in Brgy. Tanabag on ornamentals, cut flowers and food processing in collaboration with City Agriculture. TWG members, specifically the lowland group, helped in organizing the training on flowers and food processing by inviting people and assisting during training. As counterpart budget, the LPF project provided the snacks and plastic bags (for planting) to participants. Around 25 persons were attended.